

2016 MARCH BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, March 14, 2016

Chairperson Jenny Fredenburg called the 2016 March Board of Review organizational meeting to order on Monday, March 14, 2016 at 8:00 am. The meeting took place at Brighton City Hall Council Chambers, 200 N. First Street, Brighton, MI 48116.

Present: Chairperson Jenny Fredenburg. Members: Bill Farquhar, Colleen Jorgensen, and alternate member Larry Schillinger, Assessor of record Colleen Barton, and Assistant Assessor Lisa Johnson. There were no members of the public. Colleen Barton will act as secretary to the Board of Review.

Assessor, Colleen Barton suggested the cancellation of the March 23, 2016 meeting due to lack of appointments. Chairperson Jenny Fredenburg made a motion to cancel the March 23, 2016 meeting, seconded by Bill Farquhar.

Call to the Public. Hearing none.

Call to the Public closed.

Assessor, Colleen Barton presented the 2016 Roll to the board. Each member received a booklet with board of review information. Booklet included, Map of the City of Brighton, frequently asked questions letter issued by the county, copies of L-4023, Bulletin 19 of 2015, Bulletin 17 of 2015, Bulletin 14 of 2015, Bulletin 12 of 2015, Bulletin 9 of 2015, ESA Topics for Leased Equipment, ESA Topics for Direct Integrated Support, Bulletin 7 of 2015, Bulletin 22 of 2013, Bulletin 5 of 2012. The general Property tax act (excerpt) for 211.27) (excerpt for 211-7u), the 2016 Poverty exemption application and guidelines, ECF Area neighborhood list, sales studies for residential, commercial, and Industrial.

Assessor explained that on a citywide basis, Commercial Real property increased approximately 9.24%, Industrial Real increased approximately 12.56% and Residential Real increased approximately 6.86%.

Assessor reviewed the new laws and the State Tax Commission Bulletins.

Board reviewed the roll.

Chairperson Jenny Fredenburg motioned to close the organizational meeting at 8:57 am. Board adjourned Organizational Meeting and went into appeals.

8:58 am. – Appeal Hearings begin.

See Attached:

Chairperson Jenny Fredenburg motioned to adjourn meeting, second by Bill Farquhar closed the morning session at 12:00 pm.

Chairperson Jenny Fredenburg called the afternoon session to order at 1:00 pm.

Appeals continued to be heard by the Board.

See Attached.

Chairperson Jenny Fredenburg motioned to close meeting, second by Bill Farquhar, meeting adjourned at 5:00 pm.

Schedule for the 2016 March Board of Review

1/4

Monday, March 14, 2016

City of Brighton Council Chambers

Members Present: Jenny Fredenburg, Bill Farquher, Colleen Jorgensen, and alternate member Larry Schillinger

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-001	4718-99-003-003	L & R CIAO AMIC'S INC	217 W MAIN ST
<u>Board of Review Comment:</u> PETITIONER FEELS THE TCV SHOULD BE BETWEEN \$75,000 & \$80,000. DON'T THINK THE PERSONAL PROPERTY IS WORTH \$90,000. AFTER REVIEW BOARD DETERMINED ASSESSMENT TO BE ACCURATE.			

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-002	4718-31-200-045	CERVI LORENZO & SILVANA	420 S CHURCH ST
<u>Board of Review Comment:</u> PETITIONERS FEELS THE TCV OF THE PROPERTY IS \$150,000. "PROPERTY WAS SOLD (PURCHASED) AT MARKET VALUE, THE WAS NOT DISTRESS, SHORT SALE, FORECLOSURE, ETC. INVOLVED IN THE SALE SO SHOULD BE ASSESSED ACCORDINGLY. NOTE: ALSO THE PROPERTY IS REGISTERED AS MULTI-FAMILY OR RENTAL NOT AS HOMESTEAD WHERE HOMESTEAD CLASSIFICATION APPLIES (ATTACHED, IS TAX REPORT FOR GAINS & LOSSES." 1 BEDROOM RENTS FOR \$725 PER MO, 2 BEDROOM RENTS FOR \$850 CURRENTLY. AFTER REVIEW BOARD LOWERED THE AV/TV FROM \$93,000 TO \$87,500.			

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-003	4718-06-108-029	BEAVER THE FAMILY TRUST	6371 SYCAMORE VIEW DR
<u>Board of Review Comment:</u> PETITIONER FEELS THE TCV OF THE PROPERTY IS \$291,000. "TWO CONDO'S THAT ARE ON BY BLOCK SOLD FOR \$291,701 & \$289,689." COMPS SUBMITTED 845 BOXWOOD CT, & 857 BOXWOOD CT. AFTER REVIEW BOARD DETERMINED ASSESSMENT TO BE ACCURATE.			

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-004	4718-31-201-038	DRESDEN MATTHEW	130 S CHURCH ST
<u>Board of Review Comment:</u> PETITIONER FEELS THE TCV OF THE PROPERTY IS \$279,000. "\$60,000 INCREASE IN TAXABLE VALUE". COMPS SUPPLIED 333 N FRIST ST, 8401 LEE RD, 931 LINCOLN DR AND THERE APPRIASAL REPORT. AFTER REVIEW BOARD CHANGED THE AV/TV FROM \$172,300 TO \$171,000.			

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-005	4718-06-104-013	DAVIES TERESA	780 HEATHERIDGE CT
<u>Board of Review Comment:</u> PROPERTY OWNER FEELS THE TCV OF THE PROPERTY IS \$260,000. " EXCESSIVE ASSESSMENT". AFTER REVIEW BOARD LOWERED THE AV/TV FROM \$141,400 TO \$130,000.			

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-006	4718-31-202-045	BRIGHTON GRAND MANAGEMENT INC	909 E GRAND RIVER
<u>Board of Review Comment:</u> PETITIONER FEELS THAT THE TCV IS \$535,000. "THE NEW SEV SHOWN IS HIGHLY INFLATED FOR THE ACTUAL MARKET VALUE OF THIS PROPERTY. THE MOST RECENT MARKET ANALYSIS, WHICH I HAD DONE JUST TODAY, SHOWED THAT THE ACTUAL MARKET VALUE OF THE PROPERTY IS BETWEEN \$520,000 AND \$550,000. THE NEW 20169 SEV OF \$432,600 WOULD PLACE THE PROPERTY MARKET VALUE AT \$865,200, WHICH IS NOT REASONABLE, EVEN IN THIS IMPROVED MARKET." COMPARABLES SUBMITTED 609 FLINT RD, 823 RICKETT RD." AFTER REVIEW BOARD LOWERED AV FROM \$ 432,600 TO \$260,410.			

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-019	4718-06-103-021	ANGST DOUGLAS M & COLLEEN T F	1027 LONG LEAF CT
<u>Board of Review Comment:</u> PETITIONER FEELS THE TCV OF THE HOME IS \$280,000. "SEV WAY TO HIGH = HAVE DATA TO PROVE IT. NOT CLOSE TO VALID COMPS. COMPARABLES SUBMITTED 1211 BAYWOODE CIR, 8510 GLEN HAVEN IN HARTLAND TWP, 9478 PARSHALLVILLE, HARTLAND TWP, ACTIVE LISTING AT 3422 N TIPSICO LAKE RD, HARTLAND TWP. AFTER REVIEW BOARD LOWERED THE AV FROM \$153,700 TO \$140,000.			

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-020	4718-06-109-012	DAVIS PETER A & VERA K	6242 BUTTERNUT CIR
<u>Board of Review Comment:</u>			

Schedule for the 2016 March Board of Review

2 / 4

Monday, March 14, 2016

City of Brighton Council Chambers

Members Present: Jenny Fredenburg, Bill Farquher, Colleen Jorgensen, and alternate member Larry Schillinger

PETITIONER FEELS THE TCV OF THE PROPERTY IS \$292,000. " SEV CANNOT EXCEED 50% OF MARKET VALUE. COMPS SUBMITTED 6290 BUTTERNUT CIR, 6266 BUTTERNUTT CIR, 6234 BUTTERNUTT CIR, 6258 BUTTERNUTT CIR, 6209 BUTTERNUTT CIR, 6256 BUTTERNUTT CIR, 6263 BUTTERNUTT CIR. AFTER REVIEW THE BOARD CHANGED THE AV/TV FROM \$167,800 TO \$147,920.

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-021	4718-31-200-074	CASSAR SAM CO	940 E GRAND RIVER

Board of Review Comment:

PETITIONER FEELS THE TCV OF THE PROPERTY IS \$475,000. "ASSESSED VALUE TO HIGH". COMPS SUBMITTED THE MADISON COURT APARTMENTS IN CLIO MI, UTICA MANOR APARTMENTS UTICA MI, NEWPORT CREEK APARTMENTS, FARMINGTON HILLS MI, COLONIAL MANOR, BRIDGEPORT MI, COMPS FOR SALE MCDIVITT COURT APARTMENTS, THOMAS TWP MI, MILL POND MANOR APARTMENTS BRIGHTON MI. AFTER REVIEW BOARD LOWERED AV FROM \$933,000 TO \$677,300.

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-022	4718-31-204-079	3124 PARK DRIVE LLC	817 E GRAND RIVER

Board of Review Comment:

PROPERTY OWNER FEELS THE TCV OF THE PROPERTY IS \$190,000. " THE SUBJECT PROPERTY IS ASSESSED IN EXCESS OF 50% OF FAIR MARKET VALUE AS REQUIRED BY LAW. THE TRUE CASH VALUE OF \$190,000 IS SUPPORTED BY THE NOVEMBER 16, 2015 SALES PRICE, COMPARABLE SALES AND THE INCOME APPROACH TO VALUE." COMPS SUBMITTED 186 O'DOHERTY, 252 O;DOHERTY AVE, 333 N FIRST ST, 1054 MAURICE DR, 10701 MAURICE DR. AFTER REVIEW BOARD LOWERED AV/TV FROM \$127,500 TO \$104,200.

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-023	4718-06-109-011	SURMA LOUIS J JR & DIANE T	6234 BUTTERNUT CIR

Board of Review Comment:

PROPERTY OWNER FEELS THE TCV OF THE PROPERTY IS \$292,000. "TO BE TAXED ON 50% OF TRUE CASH VALUE." COMPS SUBMITTED 6242 BUTTERNUT CIR, 6290 BUTTERNUT CIR, 6266 BUTTERNUT CIR, 6234 BUTTERNUT CIR, 6258 BUTTERNUT CIR, 6209 BUTTERNUT CIR, 6255 BUTTERNUT CIR, 6263 BUTTERNUT CIR, 6110 GREEN ASH DR, 6120 NORTHRIDGE HISS DR, 867 FLOWERING PLUM DR, 6344 SYCAMORE VIEW DR, 6268 BUTTERNUTT CIR. AFTER REVIEW THE BOARD LOWERED THE AV/TV FROM \$172,200 TO \$146,780.

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-024	4718-30-202-060	BANKS DELPHINE N	4353 DEESIDE DR

Board of Review Comment:

PROPERTY OWNER FEELS THE TCV \$120,000 TO \$130,000. " I BELEIVE IT IS SOMEWHAT HIGH. THE NEIGHBOR UNDER ME COULD NOT SELL HERS FOR \$139,000.. SHE DROPPED THE PRICE TO \$129,900. NOTHING SHE HAS AHD LOOKERS NO BUYERS. BEING ON X-WAY AFFECTS PRICE." COMPS SUBMITTED 4262 DEESIDE DR, 4275 DEESIDE DR, 811 WOODRIDGE HILLS, 4353 DEESIDE. AFTER REVIEW BOARD LOWERED THE AV FROM \$73,800 TO \$69,050.

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-027	4718-30-401-123	CAMERON DOUGLAS D & LISA A	1115 SPENCER RD

Board of Review Comment:

PROPERTY OWNER FEELS THE TCV OF THE PROPERTY IS \$250,000. " VASTLY OVER ASSESSED. THE PROPOSED ASSESSMENT IS 32% HIGHER THAN LAST YEAR. NO RESIDENTIAL PROPERTY IIN THIS STATE HAS INCREASED THAT MUCH." COMPS SUBMITTED 8401 LEE RD, 424 N EAST ST, 327 S THIRD ST, 1024 W MAIN ST, 302 N SECOND ST, 635 E ST PAUL ST, 507 N SECOND ST, 130 S CHRUCH ST. AFTER REVIEW THE BOARD LOWERED THE AV FROM \$166,200 TO \$132,800.

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-043	4718-06-107-007	AMICO JOSEPH H & MARGARET A	6199 NORTHRIDGE HILLS DR

Board of Review Comment:

VA EXEMPTION GRANTED

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-044	4718-06-108-036	MITCHELL KATHLEEN H	837 BOXWOOD CT

Board of Review Comment:

VA EXEMPTION GRANTED

Schedule for the 2016 March Board of Review

3/4

Monday, March 14, 2016

City of Brighton Council Chambers

Members Present: Jenny Fredenburg, Bill Farquher, Colleen Jorgensen, and alternate member Larry Schillinger

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-045	4718-30-102-015	ABBOTT KENNETH D & TAMMY L	8709 CANDLEWOOD #6
<u>Board of Review Comment:</u> VA EXEMPTION GRANTED			

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-046	4718-30-404-063	WARREN MAURICE & KATHLEEN	443 GLENWAY
<u>Board of Review Comment:</u> VA EXEMPTION GRANTED			

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-047	4718-31-104-022	LAWRENCE LARRY	530 SPENCER RD
<u>Board of Review Comment:</u> VA EXEMPTION GRANTED			

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-048	4718-31-402-041	BROWN DAVID F	380 SPRING BROOKE DR
<u>Board of Review Comment:</u> VA EXEMPTION GRANTED			

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-049	4718-31-200-096	WARREN ROBERT A & MARY E REV TRUST	1124 SPENCER RD
<u>Board of Review Comment:</u> VA EXEMPTION GRANTED			

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-050	4718-31-307-069	SHUBERT LARRY	984 ROSEWOOD CT
<u>Board of Review Comment:</u> VA EXEMPTION GRANTED			

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-051	4718-31-307-120	DESJARDIN WILLIAM	837 WOODRIDGE HILLS DR
<u>Board of Review Comment:</u> VA EXEMPTION GRANTED			

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-052	4718-99-001-294	US BANK NATIONAL ASSOCIATION	VARIOUS
<u>Board of Review Comment:</u> AMENDED PERSONAL PROPERTY STATEMENT			

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-053	4718-99-001-467	DUGAS SUZANNE ATTORNEY	810 W GRAND RIVER
<u>Board of Review Comment:</u> AMENDED PERSONAL PROPERTY STMT			

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-054	4718-99-001-904	PARTY CITY CORPORATION	8057 CHALLIS RD
<u>Board of Review Comment:</u> LATE FILE PERSONAL PROPERTY STMT. RECEIVED PRIOR TO THE FIRST DAY OF THE MARCH BOARD OF			

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-055	4718-99-002-635	FARMER INSURANCE TOM LARSON	600 E GRAND RIVER

Schedule for the 2016 March Board of Review

4 / 4

Monday, March 14, 2016

City of Brighton Council Chambers

Members Present: Jenny Fredenburg, Bill Farquher, Colleen Jorgensen, and alternate member Larry Schillinger

Board of Review Comment:

LATE FILE PERSONAL PROPERTY STATEMENT. RECEIVED PRIOR TO THE FIRST DAY OF THE MARCH BOARD OF REVIEW.

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-056	4718-99-001-992	ROBERT KETOLA & ASSOCIATES	225 E GRAND RIVER STE 100

Board of Review Comment:

RECEIVED WRITTEN APPEAL ON 3/7/16 WITH 2016 PERSONAL PROPERTY STATEMENT AND 2016 SMALL BUSINESS TAX EXEMPTION ATTACHED. ACCEPTED LATE FILE OF 2016 PERSONAL PROPERTY STATEMENT. COULD NOT ACCEPT THE 2016 PERSONAL PROPERTY SMALL BUSINESS TAX EXEMPTION BECAUSE IT WAS NOT FILED BY FEBRUARY 10, 2016. THE CITY ASSESSOR OR THE BOARD OF REVIEW HAVE NO AUTHORITY TO ACCEPT AND UNTIMELY FILED 2016 PERSONAL PROPERTY SMALL BUSINESS TAX EXEMPTION.

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-057	4718-31-302-030	COLE PATRICIA A	802 DEVONSHIRE BLVD

Board of Review Comment:

POVERTY EXEMPTION DENIED OVER INCOME LIMIT.

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-058	4718-30-307-071	PIERSON BARBARA	915 MADISON

Board of Review Comment:

POVERTY EXEMPTION DENIED. OVER INCOME LIMIT.

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-059	4718-30-404-062	HASSIGAN GLORIA	445 GLENWAY

Board of Review Comment:

POVERTY EXEMPTION GRANTED.

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-060	4718-99-000-941	EXECUTIVE FINANCIAL PLANNING	135 W NORTH ST STE 1

Board of Review Comment:

LATE FILE PERSONAL PROPERTY STATEMENT. RECEIVED PRIOR TO THE FIRST DAY OF THE MARCH BOARD OF REVIEW.

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-061	4718-99-003-425	PROFESSIONAL ENGINEERING ASSOCIATES	7927 NEMCO WAY STE 115

Board of Review Comment:

LATE FILE PERSONAL PROPERTY STATEMENT. RECEIVED PRIOR TO THE FIRST DAY OF THE MARCH BOARD OF REVIEW.

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
14-062	4718-99-003-449	BTS CONSULTING & TRAINING LLC	323 W MAIN ST STE 201

Board of Review Comment:

LATE FILE PERSONAL PROPERTY STATEMENT. RECEIVED PRIOR TO THE FIRST DAY OF THE MARCH BOARD OF REVIEW.
