

2013 MARCH BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, March 11, 2013

Chairperson Bill Farquhar called the 2013 March Board of Review organizational meeting to order on Monday, March 11, 2013 at 8:00 am. The meeting took place at Brighton City Hall Council Chambers, 200 N. First Street, Brighton, MI 48116.

Present: Chairperson Bill Farquhar, Member Sam Ochodnicki & Member Jenny Fredenburg, Assessor of record Colleen Barton, and Assistant Assessor Linda Klein. There were no members of the public. Colleen Barton will act as secretary to the Board of Review.

Call to the Public. Hearing none.

Call to the Public closed.

Assessor, Colleen Barton presented the Roll to the board. Each member received a booklet with board of review information. Booklet included, Map of the City of Brighton, frequently asked questions letter issued by the county, copies of L-4023, warrants for Ad-Valorem and IFT's with pre-Board of Review values, Bulletin 6 of 2007, Bulletin 5 of 2012, Bulletin 10 of 2012, Bulletin 11 of 2012, Bulletin 15 of 2012, Bulletin 16 of 2012, Bulletin 17 of 2012 from the State Tax Commission, The general Property tax act (excerpt) for 211.7), the 2013 Poverty exemption application and guidelines, ECF Area neighborhood list, sales studies for residential, commercial, and Industrial and excerpts State Tax Commission Bulletin 16 of 2006.

Assessor explained that on a citywide basis, Commercial Real property decreased approximately 7.3%, Industrial Real increased approximately 3.76% and Residential Real increased approximately 1.19%.

Chairperson Sam Ochodnicki requested a listing of all sales for the time period of 10/01/2010 to 12/31/2011.

Board reviewed the roll.

9:00 am. Board adjourned Organizational Meeting and went into appeals.

9:01 am. – Appeal Hearings begin.

See Attached:

Chairperson Bill Farquhar motioned to adjourn meeting, second by Jenny Fredenburg closed the morning session at 12:00 pm.

Chairperson Bill Farquhar called the afternoon session to order at 1:00 pm.

Appeals continued to be heard by the Board.

See Attached.

Chairperson Bill Farquhar motioned to close meeting, second by Jenny Fredenburg, meeting adjourned at 5:00 pm.

Monday, March 11, 2013

Schedule for the 2013 March Board of Review

City of Brighton Council Chambers

Members Present: Jenny Fredenburg, Sam Ochodnicki, Bill Farquher

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
11-01	4718-06-106-010	HARRISON MARY K LIVING TRUST	8163 HEATHERTREE LN
		PETITIONER IS REQUESTING TCV TO BE \$45,000. "FEELS THE VALUES TOO HIGH BASED ON RECENT SALE". PRESENTED THE ASSESSMENTS FOR ALL OF EAST RIDE BLUFF. AFTER REVIEW BOARD DETERMINED ASSESSMENT TO BE ACCURATE.	
11-02	4718-31-200-096	WARREN ROBERT A & MARY E REV TRUST	1124 SPENCER RD
		VA EXEMPTION GRANTED.	
11-03	4718-30-404-062	HASSIGAN, GLORIA	445 GLENWAY
		POVERTY EXEMPTION GRANTED.	
11-04	4718-31-104-018	BYRON, ROSS I & GEORGIANNA L	309 E GRAND RIVER
		PETITIONER IS REQUESTING TCV TO BE \$ 184,000 TO \$200,000. "ASSESSED VALUE IS TO HIGH. DOES NOT REFLECT CURRENT MARKET VALUE." COMPARABLES PRESENTED 722 E GRAND RIVER, 8680 W GRAND RIVER, 2829 GRAND RIVER (HOWELL), 616 W GRAND RIVER (HOWELL), 821 E GRAND RIVER (HOWELL), TRYING TO SELL IT FOR \$200,000 AND HAS NO TAKERS. BOARD SENT ASSESSOR OUT TO MEASURE BUILDING. SQ ADJUSTED ON ROLL. AFTER REVIEW BOARD LOWERED AV TO \$125,750 AND BECAUSE OF SQ FT ADJUSTMENT CHANGE \$84,770	
11-05	4718-30-307-071	PIERSON, BARBARA	915 MADISON
		AFTER REVIEW BOARD DENIED POVERTY EXEMPTION. OVER INCOME LIMITS.	
11-06	4718-99-003-111	UNITED BANKCORP INC	205 W GRAND RIVER 102
		BANK EXEMPTION APPLICATION. AFTER REVIEW BOARD GRANTED BANK EXEMPTION.	
11-07	4718-99-000-105	STATE FARM MUTUAL INS - HEADQTR	VARIOUS
		2013 PERSONAL PROPERTY LATE FILE. AFTER REVIEW BOARD CHANGED AV/TV TO \$7,420.	
11-08	4718-99-002-781	DELL FINANCIAL SERVICES, LP	VARIOUS
		2013 PERSONAL PROPERTY LATE FILE. AFTER REVIEW BOARD CHANGED AV/TV TO \$1,360.	
11-09	4718-99-003-231	SEXTON GROUP	776 W GRAND RIVER
		2013 PERSONAL PROPERTY LATE FILE. AFTER REVIEW BOARD CHANGED AV/TV TO \$930.	
11-10	4718-99-000-263	HOLLENBERG, EDWARD A., M.D.	8589 W GRAND RIVER E
		2013 PERSONAL PROPERTY LATE FILE. AFTER REVIEW BOARD CHANGED AV/TV TO \$ 1,670.	
11-139	4718-31-305-148	REGAN CHRISTOPHER L	851 ALPINE DR
		PETITIONER IS REQUESTING TCV TO BE \$154,000. "BASED ON THE APPRAISAL REPORT, AND COMPARABLE HOMES IN THE AREA, THE 2013 ASSESSED VALUE AND TENTATIVE TV IS TOO HIGH. THE ASSESSED VALUE SHOULD BE \$77,000." PROVIDED HIS APPRAISAL AND SUMMERY OF THE INSPECTION REPORT. FEELS THE VALUE OF THE HOME MATCHES THE APPRAISAL PRICE. AFTER REVIEW BOARD LOWERED AV/TV TO \$79,720.	
11-17	4718-31-204-005	722 E GRAND RIVER PROPERTY LLC	722 E GRAND RIVER

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
			PETITIONER IS REQUESTING TCV TO BE \$126,000. "2013 ASSESSED VALUE FAR EXCEEDS TRUE CASH VALUE. 2013 TAXABLE VALUE (13.5% INCREASE OVER 2012 TAXABLE VALUE) FAR EXCEEDS AMOUNT PERMITTED BY MCL 211.27A". HE DOES NOT FEEL THEY SHOULD BE ASSESSED FOR THE ADDITIONAL ASPHALT AND SQ FOOTAGE ON THE PROPERTY THAT WAS DISCOVERED DURING A RE-EVALUATION OF THE PROPERTY AS IT WAS THERE PRIOR TO PURCHASE. THEY FEEL IT IS OMITTED PROPERTY. (MR. MACCUSO). BOARD SENT ASSESSOR OUT TO MEASURE BUILDING. SQ ADJUSTED ON ROLL. AFTER REVIEW BOARD LOWERED AV TO \$99,000 AND ADJUSTED TV TO \$55,530 DUE TO LOSS TO ROLL PER SQ FT ADJ.
11-18	4718-06-102-032	BAKER LENOARD REVOC INTER-VIVOS TRU	2240 WILLOW TREE DR
			PETITIONER IS REQUESTING TCV TO BE \$ 167,700. "13.1% INCREASE IN STATE EQUALIZED VALUE 2% INCREASE IN TAXABLE VALUE. COMPS SUPPLIED 2240 WILLOW TREE DR, 1440 DARNEL DR, 705 HEATHERIDGE CT, 6123 DOVEPLUM, 1236 CEADORWOOD DR, 6182 GREEN ASH DR, 6277 BLACK WALNUT ST, 860 FLOWERING PLUM, 868 FLOWERING PLUM DR. AFTER REVIEW BOARD LOWERED AV & TV TO \$84,250.
11-19	4718-30-100-080	BROOKSIDE DEVELOPMENT, LLC	200 BROOKSIDE LN
			PETITIONER IS REQUESTING TCV TO BE \$2,170,000. "ASSESSMENT OVER VALUED TO MARKET VALUE. POSITION SUPPORT DOCUMENTS GIVEN TO BOARD. SUBMITTED A REAL ESTATE APPRAISAL SELF-CONTAINED. RECONCILLATION IN APPRASAL WAS INCOME APPROACH \$2,170,000, SALES COMPARISON APPROACH \$1,800,000 LEASED FEE \$2,170,000. APPRIASAL DATE WAS 7/18/12 WITH THE VALUATION DATE OF 7/18/12. BOARD REQUESTED A INCOME ANALYSIS. AFTER REVIEW BOARD LOWERED AV TO \$ 1,691,930 AND KEPT TV AT \$1,691,930.
11-31	4718-31-104-019	EDBOB INVESTMENTS LLC	315 E GRAND RIVER
			PETITIONER IS REQUESTING TCV TO BE \$267,920 AV/TV \$133,960. " MARKET VALUE TO HIGH". AFTER REVIEW BOARD DETERMINED ASSESSMENT TO BE ACCURATE.