

2012 MARCH BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, March 12, 2012

Chairperson Sam Ochodnický called the first meeting of the 2012 March Board of Review to order on Monday, March 12, 2012 at 8:05 am. The meeting took place at Brighton City Hall Council Chambers, 200 N. First Street, Brighton, MI

Present: Chairperson Sam Ochodnický, Member Bill Farquhar & Member Jenny Fredenburg, Assessor of record Tracy Hayley, Acting Assessor Colleen Barton, Tax / Assessing Clerk Laura Hoshaw, Doug Shaw from WCA and one member of the public Donald Mikelec of 114 Maplegrove Ct. Colleen Barton will act as secretary to the Board of Review for today's meetings.

Call to the Public. Mr. Mikelec asked questions on property values from resident regarding land and building and how to compare. Colleen helped guide and gave answers to help Mr. Mikelec obtain comparables.

Call to the Public closed.

Acting Assessor, Colleen Barton presented the Roll to the board. Each member received a booklet with board of review information. Booklet included, frequently asked questions letter issued by the county, copies of L-4023, warrants for Ad-Valorem and IFT's with pre-Board of Review values, Bulletin 12 of 2011, Bulletin 16 of 2011, Bulletin 18 of 2011, Bulletin 7 of 2010, Bulletin 6 of 2007 from the State Tax Commission, The general Property tax act (excerpt) for 211.7u (b), the 2012 Poverty exemption application and guidelines, ECF Area neighborhood list, sales studies for residential, commercial, and Industrial, and excerpted from State Tax Commission Bulletin 16 of 2006.

Assessor explained that on a citywide basis, Commercial Real property decreased approximately 6%, Industrial Real decreased approximately 8% and Residential Real decreased approximately 3%.

Chairperson Sam Ochodnický requested a listing of all sales for the time period of 10/01/2010 to 12/31/2011 and for 1/1/2012 to 3/12/2012. Also requested all arm-length sales for Hamilton Farms from 10/1/09 to 12/31/2011.

Colleen addressed the board about lack of appointments for the March 21, 2012 meeting. Motion to cancel March 21, 2012 meeting made by Chairperson Sam Ochodnický and second by Jenny Fredenburg. Motion carried.

Board reviewed the roll.

9:10 am. Board adjourned Organizational Meeting and went into appeals as, the first petitioner arrived and the board accommodated Mr. Cooper the first petitioner.

9:10 am. – Appeal Hearings begin.

See Attached:

Chairperson Sam Ochodnický motion to adjourn meeting, second by Bill Farquhar closed the morning session at 12:00 pm.

Chairperson Sam Ochodnický called the afternoon session to order at 1:00 pm.

Appeals continued to be heard by the Board.

See Attached.

Chairperson Sam Ochodnický motioned to close meeting, second by Jenny Fredenburg, meeting adjourned at 5:00 pm.

Monday, March 12, 2012

Schedule for the 2012 March Board of Review

City of Brighton Council Chambers

Members Present: Jenny Fredenburg, Sam Ochodnicky, Bill Farquher

Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
Petition # 12-01	4718-31-201-038 COOPER CHAD & JANET	130 S CHURCH ST
	PETITIONER HAD (4) COMPLETED PAID PROFESSIONAL AND INDEPENDENT APPRAISALS ON THE PROPERTY IN THE LAST TWO YEARS AND THEY CONTINUOUSLY RETURNED AT \$225,000 AS TCV. PETITIONER SUBMITTED AN APPRAISAL. STATED NEW HOME IN OLDER NEIGHBORHOOD. AFTER REVIEW BOARD LOWERED AV & TV TO \$127,000.	
Petition # 12-02	4718-30-308-101 MONROE MICHAEL G & COLLEEN E	427 W MAIN ST
	PETITIONER FEELS THE TCV OF THE PROPERTY IS \$395,000. SUBMITTED APPRAISAL TO BOARD. COMPARABLES 132 E GRAND RIVER, 615 E MICHIGAN AV IN INGHAM COUNTY, 5 N WASHINGTON IN OXFORD MI, 313 S MAIN ST, ROCHESTER, MI, 209 W MAIN ST, BRIGHTON, 107-109 E GRAND RIVER, HOWELL MI, 102 W MAIN ST, PINCKNEY MI. AFTER REVIEW, BOARD LOWERED AV/TV TO \$197,500.	
Petition # 12-03	4718-31-301-120 DICKMEYER MICHEL & FAITH	922 BRIGHTON LAKE RD
	PETITIONER FEELS ASSESSED VALUE IS HIGH BASED ON COMP PROPERTY SALES AS SHOWN IN HIS TAX APPEAL. HIS COMPARABLES 946 BRIGHTON LAKE RD, 406 S THIRD ST, 1003 MICHIGAN ST, 1025 LIVINGSTON ST, 512 GLENWYTH RD. FEELS THAT IF THE BASEMENT WAS INTACT HOME WOULD ONLY SELL FOR \$ 180,000. AFTER REVIEW, BOARD DETERMINED ASSESSMENT TO BE ACCURATE. APPEAL DENIED.	
Petition # 12-04	4718-31-200-101 A M STEWART INVESTMENTS LLC	S CHURCH ST
	PETITIONER STATED THIS LOT WAS INCLUDED IN THE SALE AND NOT A STAND ALONE, PURCHASED FOR FREE. AFTER REVIEW, BOARD DETERMINED ASSESSMENT TO BE ACCURATE. APPEAL DENIED.	
Petition # 12-04A	4718-31-200-102 A M STEWART INVESTMENTS LLC	450 S CHURCH ST
	PETITIONER FEELS SQ FT IS INCORRECT AND ASSESSED VALUE IS WRONG. LOT 1 & 2 ARE TAXED TOGETHER, PROPERTY WAS VANDALIZED. AFTER REVIEW, BOARD DETERMINED ASSESSMENT TO BE ACCURATE. APPEAL DENIED.	
Petition # 12-05	4718-30-201-044 HAUBER JOAN E	527 CARBERRY HILL
	PETITIONER FEELS THE ASSESSED VALUE / TAXABLE VALUE IS TOO HIGH. FEELS 6 SALES IN NEIGHBORHOOD FROM 10/1/10 TO 9/30/11 ALL PRIVATE SALES AND VALUES ARE LOWER THAN HERS. FEELS HOME'S TCV IS \$60,000. HER COMPARABLES. 510 VICTORIA SQ, 502 STONEYWOOD, 515 CARBERRY HILL, 527 VICTORIA SQ, 536 VICTORIA SQ, 539 CARBERRY HILL. AFTER REVIEW BOARD LOWERED AV/TV TO \$34,990.	
Petition # 12-07	4718-25-200-017 COX JOEL	7525 CHALLIS RD
	PETITIONER FEELS ASSESSED VALUE EXCEEDS COMPARABLE HOME VALUES. SUBMITTED MORTGAGE APPRAISAL. SUBMITTED COMPS 303 S SECOND ST, 1029 MICHIGAN ST, 824 W MAIN ST, 769 ROBERTSON DR, 533 HOPE ST, 146 KISSANE AVE, 212 BRIGHTON LAKE RD. STATED THAT ABOUT 1 AC IS SWAMP AND UNUSABLE. FEELS TCV IS \$120,000. AFTER REVIEW ASSESSMENT DETERMINED TO BE ACCURATE. APPEAL DENIED.	

Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
Petition # 12-08	4718-30-301-018 618 WHITNEY LLC	618 WHITNEY ST
	PETITIONER FEELS HOME TCV IS \$60,000. FEELS COMPARABLE SALES WITHIN DATE RANGE ARE LOWER THAN ASSESSED VALUE. SUBMITTED COMPARABLES 420 N EAST ST, 700 WHITNEY(PETITIONER FEELS IS MOST COMPARABLE TO HIS HOME), 904 LIVINGSTON, 1029 MICHIGAN. AFTER REVIEW BOARD LOWERED AV/TV TO \$38,280.	
Petition # 12-09	4718-30-400-079 GRABER GLENN G & BONNY L	420 N EAST ST
	PETITIONER FEELS HOME TCV IS \$68,440. FEELS COMPARABLE SALES WITHIN DATE RANGE ARE LOWER THAN ASSESSED VALUE. SUBMITTED COMPARABLES 420 N EAST ST, 700 WHITNEY, 904 LIVINGSTON, 1029 MICHIGAN. AFTER REVIEW BOARD LOWERED AV/TV TO \$47,000.	
Petition # 12-11	4718-31-300-074 HUESTON JANET L	787 S THIRD ST
	PETITIONER FEELS TCV SHOULD BE \$130,680. FEELS 2012 SEV IS FAR IN EXCESS OF PREVALING HOME PRICES AND OWNER IS ELDERLY, FIXED INCOME - EXCESSIVE TAX BURDEN. SUBMITTED COMPS 795 S THIRD ST (PETITIONERS FEELS IS BEST COMPARABLE TO HERS), 830 DEVONSHIRE BLVD, 686 GLENWYTH RD. AFTER REVIEW BOARD LOWERED AV/TV TO \$79,860.	
Petition # 12-13	4718-31-402-016 BOOTH MARK R & CAROLYN PETERSON	328 SPRING BROOKE DR
	PETITIONER FEELS THE TCV OF THE PROPERTY IS \$ 42,000. FEELS TAXES ARE TOO HIGH. COMPARABLES SUBMITTED 320 SPRING BROOKE # 12, 417 WATER TOWER CIR, 401 SPRING BROOKE, 378 SPRING BROOKE. AFTER REVIEW BOARD LOWERED AV/TV TO \$34,600.	
Petition # 12-14	4718-31-200-100 STECEWICZ DONALD E	317 S EAST ST
	PETITIONER FEELS TCV OF THE HOME IS \$10,000. FEELS OVER ASSED, PAID \$8,000 FOR PROPERTY. OTHER LOTS RECENTLY SOLD FOR \$ 11,500 - \$12,500. COMPS PRESENTED 4718-31300-101, 4718-30-402-047. AFTER REVIEW BOARD LOWERED AV/TV TO \$ 15,870.	
Petition # 12-15	4718-31-403-004 MICHALEK, DANIEL & FRANCINE	343 COBBLESTONE CT
	PETITIONER FEELS THE TCV FOR THE PROPERTY IS \$166,500. FEELS THAT ASSESSED VALUE AND TAXABLE VALUE IS TOO HIGH. AFTER REVIEW BOARD LOWERED AV/TV TO \$88,610.	
Petition # 12-17	4718-31-203-038 FERGUSON JANE & PARADISE LISA	140 KISSANE
	PETITIONER FEELS TCV IS \$107,167. FEELS VALUE OF HOUSE DOWN TAXES GOING UP. COPARABLE SUPPLIED TO BOARD, HOME NEXT DOOR SOLD FOR \$81,500 ON 2/29/12. 146 KISSANE. AFTER REVIEW BOARD LOWERED AV/TV TO \$ 57,530.	
Petition # 12-18	4718-99-003-171 RECO EQUIPMENT INC	2021 CHARLES H ORNDORF RD
	PETITIONER FEELS PROPERTY SHOULD BE CONSIDERED INVENTOR AND AS SUCH BE EXEMPT FROM PERSONAL PROPERTY TAX. FILED AN AMENDED 2012 PP STMT. AFTER REVIEW, BOARD DETERMINED HEAVY MACHINERY IS INVENTORY BUT TRAILER IS PERSONAL PROPERTY AND TAXABLE. AV/TV LOWERED TO \$ 720.	

Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
Petition # 12-30	4718-30-405-017 BENTIVOLIO MARK L & JOE ANNE	114 PONDVIEW CT
	PETITIONER FEELS THE TCV OF THE HOME IS \$ 150,000. PETITIONER QUOTED "WE JUST PURCHASED THE CONDO IN JUNE, MICHIGANS PROPERTY TAX LAW REQUIRES THAT ASSESSMENTS BE AT 50% OF THE FAIR MARKET VALUE." PRESENTED MORTGAGE APPRAISAL DATED 5/18/2011 TO BOARD. AFTER REVIEW BOARD DETERMINED ASSESSMENT TO BE ACCURATE. APPEAL DENIED.	
Petition # 12-34	4718-99-003-134 HEALTH CARE REAL ESTATE SERVICES	407 E GRAND RIVER B
	DUPLICATE BUSINESS. ALL PERSONAL PROPERTY CLAIMED UNDER CONTRACTING RESOURCES 4718-99-002-634. AFTER REVIEW BOARD LOWERED AV/TV TO ZERO.	
Petition # 12-35	4718-99-001-763 CIT COMMUNICATIONS FINANCE CORP	VARIOUS
	ACCEPTED 2012 STMT AS FILED, SECTION F ITEMS ERRONEOUSLY LEFT ON SYSTEM WHILE EQUIPMENT IN SECTION D BELONGED TO CIT TECHNOLOGY FINANCING SVCS 4718-99-001-764. AFTER REVIEW BOARD LOWERED AV/TV TO \$ 22,240.	
Petition # 12-36	4718-99-001-961 MEIJERS THRIFTY GAS BRIGHTON	8660 W GRAND RIVER
	AMENDED STATEMENT. SIGNS ERRONEOUSLY CLAIMED UNDER SECTION A 2011 WERE ALREADY CLAIMED IN SECTION A 2010. STMT ACCEPTED AS FILED. AFTER REVIEW BOARD LOWERED AV/TV TO \$88,060.	
Petition # 12-37	4718-99-001-764 CIT TECHNOLOGY FINANCING SVCS	VARIOUS
	ACCEPTED ADDITIONAL 4TH 2012 PP STMT THAT WAS RECEIVED FROM HARTLAND TWP. AFTER REVIEW BOARD RAISED AV/TV TO \$26,520	
Petition # 12-38	4718-99-002-173 BRIGHTON BEADS	9850 E GRAND RIVER
	LATE FILE 2012 PP STMT ACCEPTED AS FILED. AFTER REVIEW BOARD INCREASED AV/TV TO \$2,380.	
Petition # 12-39	4718-99-002-925 BLYSS SALON	104 E ST PAUL ST
	LATE FILE 2012 PP STMT ACCEPTED AS FILED. AFTER REVIEW BOARD INCREASED AV/TV TO \$160.	
Petition # 12-40	4718-99-002-975 EVERGREEN HOLDINGS GROUP LLC	VARIOUS
	LATE FILE 2012 PP STMT ACCEPTED AS FILED. AFTER REVIEW BOARD LOWERED AV/TV TO \$490.	

	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
Petition # 12-42	4718-31-300-056	GRISWOLD LUCRETIA R	715 ADAMS ST
		POVERTY APPLICATION. AFTER REVIEW, BOARD REDUCED AV & TV TO 43,850.	
Petition # 12-43	4718-30-404-062	HASSIGAN, GLORIA	445 GLENWAY
		POVERTY APPLICATION. AFTER REVIEW, BOARD REDUCED AV & TV TO 39,720.	
Petition # 12-45	4718-30-202-002	ABERDEEN OF BRIGHTON	4132 DEESIDE DR
		ASSESSMENT DETERMINED TO BE ACCURATE - APPEAL DENIED	