

2011 MARCH BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Wednesday, March 23, 2011

Chairperson Jenny Fredenburg called meeting to order on Wednesday, March 23, 2011 at 12:04 p.m. Meeting took place at Brighton City Hall Council Chambers, 200 N. First Street, Brighton, MI

Present: Chairperson Jenny Fredenburg, Member Bill Farquhar, Member Sam Ochnodnick, Assessor Kathy Lupi and Assistant Assessor Colleen Barton. Kathy Lupi will act as secretary to the Board of Review.

Call to the Public: Hearing none, Chairperson Jenny Fredenburg closed the Call to the Public.

Appeals begin

See Attached

Chairperson Jenny Fredenburg adjourned the afternoon meeting at 4:05 p.m.

Chairperson Jenny Fredenburg called evening meeting to order at 5:03 p.m.

Call to the Public: Hearing none, Chairperson Fredenburg closed the Call to the Public.

Appeals begin

See Attached

Chairperson Jenny Fredenburg adjourned the meeting at 8:56 p.m.

~~Monday, March 23, 2011~~

Weds.

Schedule for the 2011 March Board of Review

City of Brighton Council Chambers

Members Present: Jenny Fredenburg, Sam Ochodnicki, Bill Farquher

	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
Petition # 23-15	4718-30-100-077	FIRST NATIONAL BANK OF HOWELL	8080 CHALLIS RD
	WRITTEN APPEAL. AFTER REVIEW, ASSESSMENT DETERMINED TO BE ACCURATE. APPEAL DENIED.		
Petition # 23-16	4718-25-200-017	BRUNO LOUIS & CAROLYN	7525 CHALLIS RD
	WRITTEN APPEAL. NO COMPARABLES PRESENTED. ASSESSMENT DETERMINED TO BE ACCURATE. APPEAL DENIED.		
Petition # 23-17	4718-31-302-030	COLE, PATRICIA A	802 DEVONSHIRE
	PETITIONER FEELS THAT HER 2011 ASSESSED VALUE IS TOO HIGH. SHE IS PROTESTING THE TV. PETITIONER FEELS THE TRUE CASH VALUE OF HER PROPERTY IS 76,000. PETITIONER WANTS TO PROTEST HER 2010 & 2011 AV. SHE PRESENTED NEIGHBORING PROPERTIES WITH A TV OF LESS THAN HERS. NO SALES COMPS PRESENTED. SHE SAID SHE HAD A MORTGAGE APPRAISAL FOR 65,000 AS OF NOVEMBER 2010 ~ ONE COMP ON 194 KISSANE, OTHERS IN BRIGHTON TOWNSHIP. PETITIONER ADVISED THAT BOARD CANNOT ADDRESS 2010 VALUE. AFTER REVIEW, REDUCTION GIVEN TO LAND VALUE FOR RAVINE IN YARD. AV LOWERED TO 49,610.		
Petition # 23-19	4718-06-104-050	DAAVETILA KAREN A	1140 MILDRED J CT
	PETITIONER PRESENTED COMPARABLES TO BOARD. SHE BELIEVES THE TRUE CASH VALUE OF THE PROPERTY TO BE 150,000. AFTER REVIEW OF AREA COMPS, ASSESSMENT DETERMINED TO BE ACCURATE.		
Petition # 23-20	4718-30-100-051	BRIGHTON COMMONS, L.L.C.	8671 W GRAND RIVER
	WRITTEN APPEAL. APPEAL RECEIVED LATE AND NO LETTER OF AUTHORIZATION WAS SUBMITTED. APPEAL DENIED.		
Petition # 23-21	4718-31-304-050	BRIGGS JR., RICHARD & PAMELA	853 DEVONSHIRE
	PETITIONER'S REPRESENTATIVE FEELS THAT THE MARKET VALUE IS 144,500. THE MARKET OF THE HOMES IN THIS AREA ARE MOSTLY UNDER \$140,000 SALES ALTHOUGH ACKNOWLEDGES THAT HIS CLIENT'S HOME IS LARGER THAN MOST. COMPARABLES PRESENTED TO BOARD: 797 OAKRIDGE, 929 FAIRWAY TRAILS, 997 ALPINE DR 1041 FAIRWAY TRAILS AND 921 FAIRWAY TRAILS. OTHERS USED WERE NOT GOOD SALES FOR VARIOUS REASONS. COMP REVIEWED BY BOARD: 844 DEVONSHIRE. AFTER REVIEW, AV DETERMINED TO BE ACCURATE.		
Petition # 23-22	4718-30-201-062	MAGALOS, CHRISTOPHER & TAIT, NANCY	558 FOXBORO SQ
	PETITIONER FEELS THAT THE AV IS TOO HIGH AND WOULD LIKE A REDUCTION. PRESENTED COMPARABLES TO THE BOARD. USED: 541 CARBERRY HILL AND 502 STONEYWOOD. BOARD CONSIDERED THE FOLLOWING COMPS 554 FOXBORO SQ, 502 & 500 STONEYWOOD, 539 AND 541 CARBERRY HILL WERE CONSIDERED BY THE BOARD. AFTER REVIEW BOARD LOWERED AV TO 36,660.		

Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
Petition # 23-23	4718-30-310-034 BAKER STEVEN D	205 MADISON
	PETITIONER FEELS THE TRUE CASH VALUE OF HIS PROPERTY IS 147,000. 205 MADISON IS SUBJECT OF APPEAL. COMPARABLES PRESENTED TO BOARD. NEIGHBORS ARE ASSESSED AT LESS SO HE FEELS THAT CONDOS SHOULD BE MORE UNIFORM. COMPS USED: 209 & 213 MADISON. AFTER REVIEW, BOARD LOWERED AV TO 74,250.	
Petition # 23-24	4718-31-100-072 MELE JEANETTE	717 WASHINGTON ST
	PETITIONER DOES NOT BELIEVE HER AV IS A TRUE REPRESENTATION OF 50% OF TCV OF HER PROPERTY. SHE PRESENTED COMPARABLES TO THE BOARD. SHE BELIEVES THE PROPERTY WOULD SELL FOR BETWEEN 110,000 - 115,000. BOARD LOOKED AT COMPARABLES: 614 WALNUT AND 217 N 5TH. AFTER REVIEW, BOARD LOWERED AV TO 75,610.	
Petition # 23-25	4718-06-101-043 MIKULEC DONALD A	1114 MAPLEGROVE CT
	PETITIONER PRESENTED COMPARABLES TO BOARD. HE PROPOSES THAT THE AV OF HIS PROPERTY SHOULD BE 93,746. AVERAGE OF COMPS IS \$76.33 PER SF, HOWEVER HIS HOME WITHOUT LAND IS \$87.50 / SF. BOARD REVIEWED COMPS: 1458 PEPPERGROVE, 1266 DURWOOD, 1054 PEPPERGROVE AND 8369 LEE ROAD. BOARD LOWERED AV TO 94,500.	
Petition # 23-26	4718-30-306-050 434 MAIN LLC	434 W MAIN ST
	PETITIONER FEELS THE TRUE CASH VALUE OF THIS PROPERTY IS 225,000. HE FEELS THAT THE AV & TV SHOULD NOT HAVE GONE UP. CURRENT TENANT PAYS \$11 / SF GROSS. HE WANTS BOARD TO LOOK AT THE AV AGAIN AND RECONSIDER THE VALUE. AFTER REVIEW, BOARD LOWERED AV TO 112,500.	
Petition # 23-27	4718-06-100-013 DAVIS, JANE E.	8401 LEE RD
	PETITIONER'S BROTHER PREPRESENTED JANE DAVIS. THIS IS AN OLD FARMHOUSE AND HE FEELS THAT IT IS ASSESSED TOO HIGH. COMPS PRESENTED TO BOARD. THE HOMES AROUND THIS HOME ARE MUCH NEWER. BOARD LOOKED AT 614 WALNUT AND GAVE REDUCTION FOR BUSY STREET. AFTER REVIEW OF COMPS, BOARD LOWERED AV TO 93,730.	
Petition # 23-28	4718-30-102-037 ROTH JAMES & NANCY	8723 MEADOWBROOK 4
	PETITIONER THINKS THIS PROPERTY SHOULD BE ASSESSED AT 11,700. OFF MARKET CONDO LIST PRESENTED TO BOARD. COMPS USED: 8723 CANDLEWOOD UNIT 4 AND 8739 GREENWILLOW UNIT 6. AFTER REVIEW, BOARD LOWERED AV TO 15,280.	
Petition # 23-31	4718-30-306-029 CLARKE, GEORGE	328 N FIRST ST
	PETITIONER HAS NO COMPS TO PRESENT AS HE SAYS THERE ARE NONE IN THE CITY. HE FEELS THAT THE MARKET VALUE OF THIS MULTI FAMILY HOME IS 109,000. HE QUESTIONS THAT THE ECF WENT UP FROM LAST YEARS ECF. AFTER REVIEW, BOARD DETERMINED AV TO BE ACCURATE.	
Petition # 23-32	4718-31-102-015 LOCONTE, LLC	132 E GRAND RIVER
	PETITIONER PURCHASED THIS PROPERTY FOR 250,000. HE FEELS THAT THE PROPERTY HAS A TRUE CASH VALUE OF 280,000. PROPERTY WAS LISTED FOR 279,900. COMPS PRESENTED: 116 W MAIN ST & 210 EAST ST. ALSO USED 121 NORTH ST ALTHOUGH HE SAYS THE NORTH PROPERTY IS A STEP LOWER THAN HIS. HE USES THE LOWER LEVEL HIMSELF. GROUND LEVEL IS JUST RENTED OUT FOR \$1,000/ MO GROSS. UPSTAIRS PAYS \$300 / MO GROSS. ONLY THREE DESIGNATED PARKING SPOTS IN REAR. AFTER REVIEW, BOARD UTILIZED AN INCOME APPROACH USING MARKET RENTS AND LOWERED AV TO 213,930.	

Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
Petition # 23-34	4718-31-402-095 RICE TIMOTHY	409 WATER TOWER CIR PROPERTY IS ASSESSED AT 42,200 AND ON MARKET FOR 87,000. NO OFFERS. NO IMPROVEMENTS HAVE BEEN MADE TO THIS PROPERTY. FEELS THAT THE TCV IS 60,000. 908 RIDGE SOLD FOR \$55,000. ALOT OF THE CONDOS ARE FOR SALE IN THIS COMPLEX AND ALOT ARE VACANT. ANOTHER SOLD FOR 62,000. AFTER REVIEW, BOARD LOWERED AV TO 39,500.
Petition # 23-35	4718-31-300-047 EDDY, NELSON	765 S THIRD ST PETITIONER'S ESTIMATE OF TRUE CASH VALUE IS 85,000. COMPARABLES SUBMITTED TO BOARD. REALTOR TOLD HIM THAT THE MOST HE COULD GET WOULD BE 87,000. TWO HOUSES FOR SALE IN THE NEIGHBORHOOD THAT ARE SIMILAR HAVE ASKING PRICES OF 88,500 & 89,000. ONLY COMP FOUND IN NEIGHBORHOOD: 931 BRIGHTON LAKE ROAD. BOARD ADJUSTED EFFECTIVE AGE AND CLASS. REDUCED AV TO 55,000.
Petition # 23-36	4718-31-311-050 CUMMINS JOSEPH	1385 NORTHERN RDG DR PETITIONER PURCHASED FOR 195,000 IN 2008. PUT A DECK & SPRINKLING SYSTEM IN AFTER PURCHASE. RECENTLY APPRAISED FOR 185,000. HE BELIEVES THE MARKET VALUE SHOULD BE 190,000. TWO COMPARABLES OUTSIDE CITY LIMITS ~ 908 FAIRWAY TRAILS AND 1379 & 842 NORTHERN RIDGE. AFTER REVIEW, BOARD LOWERED AV TO 95,000.
Petition # 23-38	4718-31-302-032 MITCHELL, EMILY	790 DEVONSHIRE PETITIONER REPRESENTING DAUGHTER. APPRAISAL SUPPLIED TO BOARD. COMPS REVIEWED BY BOARD 406 S THIRD & 509 WASHINGTON. AFTER REVIEW, BOARD LOWERED AV TO 49,610.
Petition # 23-39	4718-30-308-047 MATEM, LLC	205 S FIRST ST APPRAISAL SUPPLIED TO BOARD. BOARD FOUND COMP: 406 S THIRD. AFTER REVIEW, BOARD LOWERED AV TO 36,500.
Petition # 23-40	4718-30-402-015 MATEM, LLC	210 LEITH ST APPRAISAL SUPPLIED TO BOARD. AFTER REVIEW, AV DETERMINED TO BE ACCURATE.
Petition # 23-41	4718-30-306-084 MATEM, LLC	308 N SECOND ST NO APPRAISAL SUPPLIED TO BOARD. EACH SIDE OF DUPLEX RENTS FOR \$850 / MO. COMPS REVIEWED: 297, 195 & 307 O'DOHERTY. AFTER REVIEW, BOARD LOWERED AV TO 85,000.
Petition # 23-42	4718-30-102-036 ROTH JAMES & NANCY L	8713 CANDLEWOOD #11 PETITIONER THINKS THIS PROPERTY SHOULD BE ASSESSED AT 18,000. OFF MARKET CONDO LIST PRESENTED TO BOARD. COMPS USED: 8713 CANDLEWOOD UNITS 11 & 2 AND 8735 GREENWILLOW UNIT 10. AFTER REVIEW, BOARD LOWERED AV TO 19,790.

Petition #	Parcel #	Owner's Name	Property Address
Petition # 23-43	4718-30-100-083	BASHAR QALIEH 8550 W GRAND RVR LLC	8550 W GRAND RIVER
	PETITIONER CONTENDS THE TCV OF PROPERTY IS 732,000. GREG GARWOOD ALONG WITH OWNER PRESENTED AN INCOME ANALYSIS BASED ON \$10 / SF GROSS RENTAL. THE GROUND LEVEL HAS BEEN VACANT SINCE 2009 ~ OWNER OCCUPIES LOWER LEVEL. COMMERCIAL BROKER ESTIMATED TCV AT 732,000. AFTER REVIEW OF INCOME AND ALLOWANCES FOR MARKET RENTS AND VACANCIES, BOARD LOWERED AV TO 395,600.		
Petition # 23-44	4718-30-201-012	HILLIS DENNIS E & KRAUSE KATHRYN L	523 VICTORIA SQ
	PETITIONER FEELS THAT AV BE SHOULD BE 30,000 OR LOWER. COMPARABLES USED: 522 VICTORIA, 559 FOXBORO AND 515 CARBERRY. ALSO, 521 VICTORIA WHICH IS A SHORT SALE. BOARD CONSIDERED THE FOLLOWING COMPS 554 FOXBORO SQ, 502 & 500 STONEYWOOD, 539 AND 541 CARBERRY HILL WERE CONSIDERED BY THE BOARD. AFTER REVIEW BOARD LOWERED AV TO 35,810.		
Petition # 23-45	4718-30-102-073	MIFSUD, MICHAEL C. & CHARLES G	8729 CANDLEWOOD #8
	PETITIONER IS RENTING OUT UNIT. HE FEELS THE TCV OF THE PROPERTY IS 30,000. HE FEELS THAT THE AV IS TOO HIGH AND SEES NOTHING BEING SOLD IN THERE FOR MORE THAN 30,000. MOST SALES ARE BETWEEN 20,000 - 30,000. AFTER REVIEW, BOARD LOWERED AV TO 19,790.		
Petition # 23-46	4718-31-206-002	SUD SWATANTRA	616 RICKETT RD 102
	PETITIONER BOUGHT AS A BANK SALE LAST YEAR, HOWEVER FEELS THAT ALTHOUGH HE GOT A GOOD DEAL THE AV IS TOO HIGH. PETITIONER FEELS TCV IS 50,000 - 60,000. COMPS PRESENTED TO BOARD. COMPS: 616 RICKETT #110 & 559 FOXBORO SQUARE. NO SALES WITHIN COMPLEX. AFTER REVIEW, BOARD LOWERED AV TO 30,000.		
Petition # 23-47	4718-31-305-102	JENG DENNIS	877 FAIRWAY TRAILS DR
	PETITIONER PRESENTED COMPARABLES TO BOARD. SALES AND LISTINGS. PETITIONER PROPOSES A TCV OF 121,000 AND AN AV OF 60,500. COMPS REVIEWED BY BOARD: 750 FAIRWAY AND 961 DEVONSHIRE. AFTER REVIEW, BOARD LOWERED AV TO 71,760.		
Petition # 28-01	4718-31-311-045	DEARBORN MATTHEW J & NICOLE A	1372 SEWARD DR
	PETITIONER FEELS THE TRUE CASH VALUE OF THIS PROPERTY IS 204,000. PROPERTY IS A SITED CONDO. COMPARABLES PRESENTED TO BOARD. AFTER REVIEW OF AREA COMPS 1363 SEWARD AND 1366 SEWARD, BOARD DETERMINED AV TO BE ACCURATE.		